Faculty Mentoring Climate Survey: Early Findings and Impacts
Faculty Council
Friday, April 16, 2021

Erin Malloy, MD
Director, Center for Faculty Excellence
Lead Principal Investigator, TEAM ADVANCE
Professor and Director of Medical Student Education,
Department of Psychiatry
Secondary appointment in Social Medicine, School of Medicine

Kia Caldwell, PhD
Special Assistant to the Provost for TEAM ADVANCE
Co-Principal Investigator, TEAM ADVANCE
Professor, Department of African, African American, and Diaspora Studies
College of Arts and Sciences

*Slide 4 Revised 12/09/2020
Catalyze a culture of active, equitable, and effective mentoring for faculty across the University and across social identities.

**Objective 1:** Special Assistant to the Provost

**Objective 2:** Resources for Chairs and Deans

**Objective 3:** Develop Faculty Mentors

**Objective 4:** Support Early- and Mid-Career Faculty Mentees
Mentoring Climate Survey

Preliminary Report: Spring 2020
Spring 2020 Mentoring Climate Survey
Respondent Data: Unit, Rank, Track

Total Faculty Respondents Across ALL Units (n=980)
- Medicine (44.3%)
- Arts and Sciences (29.6%)
- Global Public Health (6.4%)
- Pharmacy (4%)
- Business (3.3%)
- Dentistry (2.8%)
- Nursing (2.3%)
- Education (1.4%)
- Media and Journalism (1.4%)
- Information and Library Science (1.2%)
- Law (1.2%)
- Social Work (1.0%)
- Government (.7%)
- VC Research (.3%)

Survey open April 16 – May 22, 2020. Initial announcement followed by 9 reminders (twice weekly). Response rate: ~19%. All questions optional—some respondents skipped questions. All sample sizes noted.
Spring 2020 Mentoring Climate Survey
Respondent Data: Gender and Race

Respondents by Gender, All Units (n=972)
- Male (410) (57%)
- Female (552) (42%)
- Gender Variant, Non-Conforming, and Other (10) (1%)

Respondents by Race, All Units (n=960)*
- White (695) (72%)
- Black or African American (71) (9%)
- Asian or Asian American (86) (9%)
- Hispanic, Latinx, or Spanish Origin (37) (4%)
- Two or More (42) (4%)
- Other Ethnicity (29) (3%)

*Categories for Race and Ethnicity align with categories used by United States Census and by UNC-CH Office of Institutional Research and Assessment.

Male includes transgender male; female includes transgender female.
Spring 2020 Mentoring Climate Survey
Key Findings: Possible Needs?

**Majority** of respondents report finding a mentor on their own

- 39.7% Within their department
- 61.4% In the University
- 70.2% Outside the University

**Two-thirds** report departmental mentoring for junior faculty

- 66% Junior Faculty
- 29.6% Mid-Career Faculty
- 37.5% Fixed-Term Faculty

**Team mentoring** is more common than other mentoring models

- 42.6% Team
- 20.2% Dyadic
- 18.1% Peer

**About one-quarter** meet with mentors once per year (or less)

Tends to be higher for men of color (30.6%).
Increases in Satisfaction with Mentoring
Fall 2019 to Spring 2020

Data reflect mean scores (scale: 1 to 5, with 5 indicating “very satisfied.”)
### Spring 2020 Mentoring Climate Survey

**Equity and Access to Mentoring**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>All</th>
<th>Women of Color</th>
<th>White Women</th>
<th>Men of Color</th>
<th>White Men</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>My department’s mentoring program addresses issues of gender inequity</td>
<td>28.2%</td>
<td><strong>19.6%</strong></td>
<td>21.6%</td>
<td>37.1%</td>
<td>39.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n=824)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My department’s mentoring program addresses issues of racial inequity</td>
<td>32.8%</td>
<td><strong>25.2%</strong></td>
<td>31.2%</td>
<td>37.7%</td>
<td>37.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n=928)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My department’s mentoring program addresses other issues of inequity</td>
<td>16.6%</td>
<td><strong>9.2%</strong></td>
<td>14.7%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>21.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e.g., religion, national origin, language/accent) (n=845)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My department takes an intersectional approach to mentoring its faculty</td>
<td>16.5%</td>
<td><strong>10%</strong></td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>22.2%</td>
<td>20.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n=826)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In my department, balance among work and other priorities is emphasized in</td>
<td>33.5%</td>
<td><strong>28.9%</strong></td>
<td>29.4%</td>
<td>40.7%</td>
<td>39.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mentoring. (n=843)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I have the same access to mentoring as others in my department</td>
<td>39.8%</td>
<td><strong>35.9%</strong></td>
<td>37.5%</td>
<td>42.2%</td>
<td>44.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n=840)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My chair is dedicated to ensuring all faculty are mentored effectively</td>
<td>48.2%</td>
<td><strong>42.7%</strong></td>
<td>44.9%</td>
<td>49.5%</td>
<td>55.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n=843)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Respondents who at least “somewhat agreed” with each statement, following a 5-point scale (with 1 indicating “strongly disagree” and 5 indicating “strongly agree”).
TEAM ADVANCE
Faculty Participation and Early Impacts
TEAM ADVANCE Faculty Participation 2019-2020

Total Unique Faculty Participants* Across ALL Programs

- CAS Natural Sci. (42)
- CAS Soc. Sci. (18)
- CAS Fine Arts & Hum. (19)
- SOM Basic Sci. (11)
- SOM Clinical (57)
- Public Health (23)
- Pharmacy (9)
- Other Schools/Units (12)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Fixed Term</th>
<th>Tenure Track</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Professor</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instructor or Lecturer</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Demographics

- White Women (35)
- BIPOC Women (33)
- White Men (68)
- BIPOC Men (59)

- Women in STEM (2 Events) (Obj. 4)
- Professional Development Workshops (6 Events) (Obj. 4)
- Faculty Mentor Trainig (2 Cohorts) (Obj. 3)
- Developing Mentoring Plans Workshop (Obj. 2)
- Women ADVANCE Leadership (Obj. 4)
- Peer Mentoring Circles (Obj. 4)
  - 8 Active Circles
  - 16 Facilitators
  - 52 Peers

*47 participated in 2 or more programs

Black, Indigenous, or People of Color (BIPOC) include faculty who are Black or African American; Asian or Asian American; Hispanic, Latinx, or of Spanish descent; American Indian or Alaska Native; Middle Eastern or North African; or Native Hawaiian or Pacific Islander.
TEAM ADVANCE Faculty Participation 2020-2021

Total Unique Faculty Participants* Across ALL Programs

- CAS Natural Sci. (45)
- CAS Soc. Sci. (20)
- CAS Fine Arts & Hum. (18)
- SOM Basic Sci. (17)
- SOM Clinical (65)
- Public Health (21)
- Education (6)
- Nursing (5)
- Other Schools/Units (19)

216

*45 participated in 2 or more programs

Demographics**

- White Women 6%
- BIPOC Women 28%
- White Men 51%
- BIPOC Men 15%

Faculty Mentoring Programs

- Faculty Mentor Training (2 Cohorts) (Obj. 3) 58
- Women ADVANCE Leadership (Obj. 4) 30
- Peer Mentoring Circles (Obj. 4) 72
- Professional Development Workshops (5 Events) (Obj. 4) 106

Other Programs

- Panel: Strategies to Support the Success of Mid-Career Faculty (Obj. 2) 19
- Two additional events planned for Obj. 2 in May, 2021

**Black, Indigenous, or People of Color (BIPOC) include faculty who are Black or African American; Asian or Asian American; Hispanic, Latino, or of Spanish Origin; American Indian or Alaska Native; Middle Eastern or North African; or Native Hawaiian or Pacific Islander. Percentages are approximate.

*Other Schools/Units include Pharmacy, Dentistry, Media & Journalism, SILS, Social Work, Law, and Government
How Was TEAM ADVANCE Helpful?
Peer Mentoring Circles

IMPACT

Safe spaces

Networking

Peers of similar social identities (gender, race)

Relationships with senior faculty

Sharing resources

“It was helpful to have a dedicated and safe space where we can raise issues that we’re facing in our departments, and hear what other faculty are experiencing. It’s also been incredible to build relationships with more senior faculty (our facilitators).”

Black Woman, Assistant Professor, Tenure Track, Spring 2020

“It was useful to compare mentoring approaches with peers in other departments. Mentoring and goal-setting advice provided in the mentoring workshop program was helpful for thinking about what to do with a mentor.”

Latinx Man, Lecturer, Fixed Term, Fall 2020

“Seeing how tenure track peers were encouraged to build networks was useful as a fixed term faculty member when no guidance is given at all in my instance.”

Black Woman, Lecturer, Fixed Term, Spring 2020

“I greatly enjoyed and valued the time with my peer mentoring circle. We had wonderful conversations, learned together, supported one another and it was a wonderful resource for networking.”

White Woman, Assistant Professor, Fixed Term, Spring 2020

“It was very helpful to have a dedicated and safe space where we can raise issues that we’re facing in our departments, and hear what other faculty are experiencing. It’s also been incredible to build relationships with more senior faculty (our facilitators).”

Latinx Woman, Assistant Professor, Fixed Term, Spring 2020
How Was TEAM ADVANCE Helpful?
Women ADVANCE Leadership

**IMPACT**

Formation of *lasting, supportive* peer relationships

Development of *leadership identity*

Participants proposed *29 leadership change*

---

“I have been looking to reorient my *short and long-term career goals* following tenure (1.5 years ago) and have not had effective mentorship in how to do this. I also wanted to generally strengthen my *leadership* and *mentorship* skills as I am now taking on higher-level responsibilities. *Women [ADVANCE] Leadership* seminar series has been helpful in both these regards.”

White Woman, Associate Professor, Tenured, Fall 2020

“Great *speakers*, exercises for *concretizing* interests, desires and an *action plan.*”

Black Woman, Associate Professor, Tenured, Fall 2020

“It gave me a venue to focus on my own *professional* and *career development*, which is not a focus in my home department. It was nice to really *interact* with other *faculty* across the university—which we do not get to do very often.”

White Woman, Associate Professor, Tenured, Spring 2020

“The *leadership development* and *peer networking* perspectives were helpful in the *Women ADVANCE Leadership* series, I enjoyed the activities and presentations and discussions.”

White Woman, Professor, Tenured, Fall 2020
How Was TEAM ADVANCE Helpful? Faculty Mentor Training

IMPACT

**Gender and racial inequities** in the academy

Understanding **intersectionality** in mentoring relationships

Articulating a **mentoring philosophy** and plan

“Learning about *racial and gender inequalities* in academia has provided me with a number of new perspectives. These ideas help me to make informed decisions when it comes to **hiring** and my **interactions with colleagues**.”

_White Woman, Associate Professor, Fixed Term, Spring 2020_

“Understanding **intersectionality** helped me to **advocate** for mentees.”

_White Woman, Professor, Tenured, Spring 2020_

“They were valuable to **educate me in obstacles** to young faculty that I was not sufficiently conscious of.”

_White Man, Professor, Tenured, Fall 2020_

“Learned to **refine mentoring approach** and set limits for mentoring.”

_Asian Woman, Professor, Tenured, Fall 2020_

“It was nice to have the **time/space** carved out to think about **my own mentoring strategies** and **how to improve** my process.”

_White Woman, Assistant Professor, Tenure Track, Fall 2020_
“The peer mentoring was good because I connected with other women who were going through the same things. It was good to know I’m not alone. However, it was eye-opening to see that most of us feel very undervalued and experience systemic discrimination that we, unfortunately, have to just put up with because we’re too busy trying to keep our heads above water to do anything about it ourselves.”

White Woman, Assistant Professor, Fixed Term, Spring 2020
Mentoring Climate Survey

Fall 2020 Preliminary Report: Impacts of COVID-19, Comparison by Gender and Race
Has a diagnosis of COVID-19 impacted your health or the health of a family member?

- The majority of respondents to the COVID-19 questions were women (n=355).
- More women than men answered “yes” to this question.
The COVID-19 pandemic has impacted my workload or work responsibilities.

Data reflect mean scores (scale: 1 to 5, with 1 indicating “decreased a lot” and 5 indicating “increased a lot.”)

The COVID-19 pandemic has impacted my overall stress.

Data reflect mean scores (scale: 1 to 5, with 1 indicating “decreased a lot” and 5 indicating “increased a lot.”)
Faculty described how the COVID-19 pandemic has had an impact on workloads, work responsibilities, and overall stress.

“It feels a bit stagnant. Many of the research plans I had wanted to do have now been delayed and having to find alternative strategies.”

Black Woman, Assistant Professor, Fixed-Term

“Slowed laboratory research significantly.”

White Man, Professor, Tenured

“I have had invited presentation[s] cancelled (not postponed), the inability to travel to conferences has significantly reduced networking ability/opportunities, and general stress has made it difficult to focus on my research output.”

Asian Man, Professor, Tenured

“Due to increased responsibilities both at work and at home, the ability to work on items related to promotion has decreased significantly.”

Latinx Woman, Assistant Professor, Fixed-Term

“Less interest in my career.”

Multiracial Woman, Professor, Tenured

Time for reading and research has diminished to almost nothing, due to spending more time on teaching (especially meeting one-on-one with students and providing more written feedback on assignments) and a ton more administrative responsibilities.

White Woman, Professor, Tenured
I have experienced disruptions to work in order to care for children in my home.

- White Men (n=110): 2.8
- White Women (n=203): 3.18
- BIPOC Men (n=30): 3.27
- BIPOC Women (n=66): 3.18

Data reflect mean scores (scale: 1 to 5, with 5 indicating “very often.”) with a significance level of p < .05.
Fall 2020 Mentoring Climate Survey
Gender and Race Comparison: Impacts of COVID-19

“I don’t feel that I’m performing as strongly as I would if I didn’t have to care for a toddler.”

White Woman, Assistant Professor, Fixed Term

“I worry that I will be alive - hard to focus on anything else than survival of my children and my elderly parents.”

White Man, Assistant Professor, Fixed Term

“I was half-way through one of our all-too-rare research and study leaves when the pandemic shuttered campus and sent me home to care for my children. My productivity during the leave declined.”

Latinx Man, Associate Professor, Tenured

“Yes, I’ve missed out on opportunities due to increased childcare.”

White, Gender Nonconforming, Assistant Professor, Fixed Term

Data reflect mean scores (scale: 1 to 5, with 5 indicating “very often.”)
Fall 2020 Mentoring Climate Survey
Gender and Race Comparison: Impacts of COVID-19

I have experienced gender discrimination.

Data reflect mean scores (scale: 1 to 5, with 5 indicating “very often.”)

I have experienced racial discrimination.

Data reflect mean scores (scale: 1 to 5, with 5 indicating “very often.”)
Our TEAM

**Erin Malloy**, Lead PI  
Director, Center for Faculty Excellence  
Professor and Director of Medical Student Education,  
Department of Psychiatry  
Secondary appointment in Social Medicine (SOM)

**Robert Blouin**, Co-PI  
Provost and Executive Vice Chancellor  
Bryson Distinguished Professor, (Eshelman)

**Jaye Cable**, Co-PI  
Senior Associate Dean for Natural Sciences and Mathematics  
Professor, Department of Marine Sciences (CAS)

**Kia Caldwell**, Co-PI  
Special Assistant to the Provost for TEAM ADVANCE  
Professor, Department of African, African American and Diaspora Studies (CAS)

**Kelly Ryoo**, Co-PI  
Associate Professor, School of Education

**Kevin Guskiewicz**, Senior Personnel  
Chancellor  
Kenan Distinguished Professor, Athletic Training,  
Department of Exercise and Sport Science (CAS)  
Co-Director, Matthew Gfeller Sport-Related TBI Research Center

**Patricia Parker**, Senior Personnel  
Professor and Chair, Department of Communication (CAS)

**Gloria Thomas**, Senior Personnel  
Director, Carolina Women’s Center

**Shauna Cooper**  
Faculty Fellow for Intersectionality and Gender Equity  
Associate Professor and Director of Diversity Initiatives,  
Department of Psychology and Neuroscience (CAS)

**Susan Girdler**  
Advisor for Mentoring Program Development  
Lead PI, The PROMISE Study  
CFE Faculty-in-Residence for Faculty Mentoring  
Professor and Vice Chair of Faculty Development, Department of Psychiatry (SOM)

**Jonatha Foland**  
Research Project Manager

**Brionca Taylor**  
Graduate Student Program Assistant  
Doctoral Candidate, Department of Sociology (CAS)

**Wenxin Zeng**  
Graduate Student Program Assistant for Data Assessment  
Master’s Student, Information Science (SILS)
TEAM ADVANCE
TARGETING EQUITY IN ACCESS TO MENTORING • UNC

cfe.unc.edu/team-advance/   teamadvance@unc.edu

Follow us on Twitter: @UNC_TEAMADVANCE